

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MISSOURI  
EASTERN DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, )  
 )  
Plaintiff, )  
 )  
v. ) No. 4:16-CV-00180 CDP  
 )  
CITY OF FERGUSON, )  
MISSOURI, )  
 )  
Defendant. )

STATUS HEARING

BEFORE THE HONORABLE CATHERINE D. PERRY  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

JULY 9, 2024

APPEARANCES:

Monitor: Natasha Tidwell, Esq.  
Courtney Caruso, Esq.  
  
For Plaintiff: Nancy Glass, Esq.  
Amy Senier, Esq.  
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
  
For Defendant: Thomas R. Selig, Esq.  
LEWIS RICE LLC  
  
Also Present: Christopher Crabel

REPORTED BY: ANGELA K. DALEY, CSR, RMR, FCRR, CRR  
Official Court Reporter  
United States District Court  
111 South Tenth Street, Third Floor  
St. Louis, MO 63102  
(314) 244-7978

INDEX

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

PUBLIC COMMENT

Page

Statement by Becky Mueller	5
Statement by Adrian Shropshire	8
Statement by Erica M. Brooks	11
Statement by Cassandra Butler	15

STATEMENTS BY PARTIES

Statement by Chris Crabel	18
Statement by Ms. Senier	23
Statement by Ms. Caruso	29
Statement by Mr. Selig	38
Statement by The Court	38

**(PROCEEDINGS STARTED AT 10:00 A.M.)**

1  
2 THE COURT: Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. We  
3 are here in the case of the United States versus the City of  
4 Ferguson, case number 4:16-CV-180. We are here for the  
5 quarterly status hearing, and so before we begin, I do want to  
6 remind anyone who is listening on the Court's YouTube channel  
7 where this is being broadcast that any additional broadcasting  
8 or recording of this proceeding is forbidden and you must not  
9 broadcast it further or record it in any way. We are very  
10 happy for you to tell other people to sign on to YouTube if  
11 other people want to listen, but no broadcasting or further  
12 copying.

13 All right. So I will start with the Department of  
14 Justice and ask counsel to please state who is here for the  
15 record.

16 MS. SENIER: Good morning, Your Honor. Amy Senier  
17 for the Department of Justice.

18 MS. GLASS: And good morning, Your Honor, Nancy Glass  
19 also for the Department of Justice.

20 THE COURT: All right. And for the City.

21 MR. SELIG: Good morning, Your Honor, Thomas Selig  
22 for the City of Ferguson.

23 MR. CRABEL: Chris Crabel for the City of Ferguson.

24 THE COURT: And, Mr. Selig, would you go ahead and  
25 introduce any other people from the City who are here with

1 you.

2 MR. SELIG: Yes. Thank you, Your Honor. So at the  
3 table, Chris Crabel, the Consent Decree coordinator who just  
4 introduced himself. We have John Hampton, the City Manager  
5 for the City of Ferguson who is here in person, and then  
6 online we have Mayor Ella Jones who is joining via the link as  
7 well as Councilwoman Naquittia Noah, Councilwoman Heather  
8 Robinett, Councilwoman Linda Lipka, and then Councilman Nick  
9 Kasoff. And I believe that's everyone, Your Honor.

10 THE COURT: All right. So I appreciate everyone  
11 being here either live or by listening to the broadcast that  
12 is going out, so that's great. For the Monitor?

13 MS. CARUSO: Good morning, Your Honor, Courtney  
14 Caruso, deputy monitor on behalf of the Monitoring Team. I am  
15 going to be presenting today, but here with me is the Monitor  
16 Natashia Tidwell and two other members of the Monitoring Team  
17 who are sitting in the jury box, Dan Gomez and Darryl Owens.

18 THE COURT: All right. Glad to see you here today.  
19 All right. So we are ready to proceed, and the way we do  
20 this, this is a hearing. Kayla, has anybody signed up to  
21 speak?

22 THE CLERK: I believe we did have a couple sign up.

23 THE COURT: This is a -- every other quarter, as you  
24 all know, we have comments from any members of the public who  
25 wish to speak, so the clerk is getting the list for me and

1 we'll do that first, and then after we hear from any citizens  
2 who have signed up and wish to speak, then we will hear from  
3 the parties.

4 So I see the first person on the list is Becky -- I'm  
5 sorry, I can't remember if it's Mueller or Mueller?

6 MS. MUELLER: Mueller.

7 THE COURT: All right. Becky Mueller. I know I have  
8 asked that question before, but if you will just step up to  
9 the lectern, ma'am.

10 MS. MUELLER: Good morning, Your Honor. As always,  
11 Alan and I appreciate the opportunity to share our thoughts  
12 before the Court. I'm Becky Mueller, resident of Ferguson,  
13 and most of our comments this morning are provided to show our  
14 appreciation for the changes and progress that is now being  
15 made. We do want to thank Ms. Amy Senier and Ms. Nancy Glass  
16 for the presentation last night in Ferguson. Although he did  
17 not participate in the presentation, we also want to thank  
18 Mr. Jorge Castillo for agreeing to start the discussion. The  
19 presentation provided information about the Consent Decree  
20 process that we all really needed. We appreciate this and all  
21 the DOJ's efforts to increase transparency and support  
22 community outreach. We continue to see progress in several  
23 areas.

24 First, the June meeting of the Neighborhood Policing  
25 Steering Committee --

1 THE COURT: I'm going to stop you for just a second.  
2 The court reporter is taking down everything you say, and so  
3 you are going a little bit fast. I am not telling you you  
4 have to slow down a lot but just a little bit. Thanks.

5 MS. MUELLER: Sorry. I am trying to get it all in in  
6 five minutes.

7 THE COURT: I understand.

8 MS. MUELLER: The June meeting of the Neighborhood  
9 Policing Steering Committee was devoted to a presentation by  
10 Ms. Pat Washington on the Community Policing and Engagement  
11 Plan. Because of the clear objectives outlined by  
12 Ms. Washington, the NPSC agreed to use our next three meetings  
13 to revise and develop the Community Policing Plan. We  
14 appreciate Ms. Washington's efforts to help with NPSC's  
15 outreach, working with them to update the mission statement,  
16 design a brochure, and possibly design a logo. We have not  
17 had this kind of productive relation with the City before.

18 Second, the training committee has also seen much  
19 progress. We really appreciate all of Ms. Lisa Stephens's  
20 work. She has proposed very good subject matter experts and  
21 lesson plans and is moving to get the trainings in place as  
22 soon as possible. Our main issue is finding the right balance  
23 between getting the training on the new policies to happen  
24 quickly and ensuring that the Ferguson Police Department  
25 institutionalizes the culture of community policing and

1 problem solving. There is a lot of pressure to just get it  
2 done versus get it done right. This is an issue particularly  
3 for the training committee as we review the PTO training. We  
4 are in the process of reviewing drafts of all 14 or 15  
5 modules. The FPD still needs to clarify the scope and methods  
6 of the training program that will work best for them. Once  
7 these are determined, we'll be glad to expedite our reviews of  
8 these modules to help make it the best training possible.

9 We still need an understanding of the progress on  
10 many other items of the Consent Decree. As one example, we do  
11 not know the status of the Crime Prevention Plan. The content  
12 of the Crime Prevention Plan could be extremely important as  
13 the NPSC reviews the Community Policing and Engagement Plan.  
14 We still do not have a dashboard so the community can track  
15 progress on the Consent Decree compliance, and in addition,  
16 the City Council recently approved the use of several new  
17 technologies such as drones and pole-mounted license plate  
18 readers. We do not know if there are policies in place  
19 regulating the use of these new technologies and how their use  
20 is going to coordinate with complying with Consent Decree  
21 policies for community policing. There needs to be a  
22 mechanism in place to quickly respond with appropriate  
23 policies and to ensure that the public is aware of and could  
24 have input on those new policies.

25 I would, however, like to end on a positive note. I

1 would like to compliment the Ferguson Police Department for  
2 their service during the Juneteenth celebration. They seemed  
3 to exemplify good community policing. The officers looked  
4 like they were enjoying the event more and certainly  
5 interacting with the community better. Their deployment  
6 didn't seem to diminish their ability to observe and respond  
7 to incidences that might develop either at events or  
8 throughout the community, and we appreciate their efforts to  
9 make this a positive event. Thank you.

10 THE COURT: All right. Thank you very much. All  
11 right. The next speaker is Adrian Shropshire. Yes, sir.

12 MR. SHROPSHIRE: Good morning, Judge.

13 THE COURT: Good morning.

14 MR. SHROPSHIRE: Good morning, citizens and DOJ. I  
15 am here today -- well, first of all, let me tell you my role  
16 in the City of Ferguson. I'm on the Citizens Review Panel of  
17 all officers that are being hired into the precinct. I'm on  
18 the training and setting up the training policies for the  
19 police department. I'm with the FYI Youth, and I am a member  
20 of the NPSC. During my time during the role of the hiring of  
21 the police officers, the Citizens Review Panel, we have hired  
22 officers that want to be here. We have hired officers that  
23 have special tasks such as we just hired two officers that do  
24 the drones. They are FAA certified. And then we have other  
25 officers that are -- that wanted to be here. The officers



1 that didn't want to be here, I feel they left early in our  
2 hiring process.

3 I've been on this committee, the citizens committee,  
4 now for probably, oh, six or seven years now, and I have seen  
5 officers come and go, but the ones that Chief Doyle has hired,  
6 they are staying. They believe in training, they believe in  
7 coaching, and they believe in the city of Ferguson being a  
8 better city than what it was before. Chief Doyle has made a  
9 big change within our city, the look of the police department.  
10 We have new uniforms. We have new badges. We have new police  
11 cars, and we have a new culture that is being grown within our  
12 police department. As a citizen that is on the hiring  
13 committee, I see that as they come through the door. Chief  
14 Doyle takes our advice. He just doesn't sweep it underneath  
15 the rug. He takes our advice and our interview papers and  
16 goes over them and does weigh-in on what we say because we are  
17 the citizens. We don't wear the blue. We wear regular  
18 everyday clothes and we have a better judgment sometimes of  
19 people, at least I do. I have learned a lot about the police  
20 department within my time doing this.

21 As far as with our training, I started out when all  
22 this started back a long time ago when it was I think right  
23 around 2016. I've been with the Citizens Training Committee  
24 since then. I look at how things have changed since  
25 Ms. Stephens has been there and how things have changed since

1 Lieutenant Ray Rice has been there. There are things that are  
2 moving forward within our police department. I asked an  
3 officer the other day what is the most important thing that he  
4 feels important to all police officers, and the thing -- and  
5 the one thing that he told me was training, and to me there is  
6 a big difference between training and coaching. And we on the  
7 training committee, we do believe in training our officers to  
8 the best of their ability. As Coach Doyle -- as Chief Doyle  
9 has been with our police department, the citizens are very  
10 comfortable with him within the ranks of being the chief.

11 I want to say one thing, too. Chris Crabel, he is  
12 doing the best he can do at this point getting our dashboard  
13 up and going. It's a lot of work to do that, but, you know, I  
14 know it should be a little bit further, but we are working  
15 together as a team, and that's what counts as far as I'm  
16 concerned in us moving forward with this Consent Decree.

17 I look at Lieutenant Dilworth. He is doing a great  
18 job at role call training, and that's very important. And one  
19 thing I must say, the extra hours that the officers that come  
20 to Ferguson have to put in, they really have to want to be  
21 here because it makes a big difference when you have to go to  
22 role call training or take training on your day off or do  
23 different -- go to body cam training. That makes a big  
24 difference. Our officers are out in the community, which is a  
25 big difference than it was. I've been living in the community

1 now for 36 years, and it's a big difference in what was and  
2 what is now.

3 Nobody's perfect, but we are striving for excellence  
4 and dependability and accountability, and to me that equals  
5 trustworthiness, and our officers are doing that within our  
6 community. I see them out with the kids, the citizen. They  
7 are at all the events and they want to be there. They are  
8 happy to be part of Ferguson and the new Ferguson, and I think  
9 as long as we keep pushing forward with our training  
10 coordinator and our information officer, I think that things  
11 will move forward and I think we'll be moving this Consent  
12 Decree within the next -- I hope to have it rolling within the  
13 next year, end of this year or into early next year because  
14 the courts --

15 THE COURT: I hope that, too. And so your red  
16 light's been blinking awhile, so go ahead and wrap it up.

17 MR. SHROPSHIRE: Okay. Sorry, Judge. But I would  
18 just like to say our courts are very, very good now. Thank  
19 you.

20 THE COURT: Thank you. Erica Brooks.

21 MS. BROOKS: Good morning, Your Honor.

22 THE COURT: Good morning.

23 MS. BROOKS: And everybody else in their respective  
24 places. My name is Erica M. Brooks, and I am a citizen of  
25 Ferguson, Missouri. I'm from East St. Louis, and one

1 situation that I can bring up at this point, in 2013 I was  
2 racially profiled by an officer with a white shirt. I was  
3 actually getting ready to take my daughter to college the next  
4 morning. It was 12:00 a.m. in the morning, and when he pulled  
5 me over, he had his flashlight searching in my van. It was  
6 packed with all her college equipment, and he asked me where  
7 were we going. He never told me why he pulled me over. I  
8 wasn't one of the people that were charged, you know, to be  
9 able to get like a ticket or a citation or whatever else, but  
10 the experience of not knowing the reputation of Ferguson  
11 before I got there, I didn't know Ferguson was known to be a  
12 sundown town. I didn't know it to be racially profiling  
13 people for their color. I didn't know any of that until 2014.

14 As far as what I do for a living, I'm a freelance  
15 media photographer. First of all, I am a parent, a single  
16 parent. I'm a clear advocate for Ferguson. I've been a  
17 candidate for city council twice, and also in 2019, my son and  
18 I saved our bus service in Ferguson, number 79. It was slated  
19 to be cut by the City and Metro. I didn't know anything about  
20 it. I just happened to be riding on the bus -- going to the  
21 bus and it popped up on my phone about it being cut. And so  
22 when it came down to saving our bus service, we did the whole  
23 thing, you know, ourselves with a lot of support from the  
24 community and other people to retain our service. I'm saying  
25 it to say it comes down to civil rights for the citizens of

1 Ferguson.

2 I listened to all this. I was right there engaged  
3 with the protestors as a freelance media photographer from day  
4 one, August 11th, with my camera looking right between the  
5 protestors as well as the police, and to see all this has  
6 brought me back to the 60s and other dates when African  
7 Americans had to fight for civil rights. And I hear all this  
8 said about policies and procedures and training. It doesn't  
9 make sense to me because if you treat people the way you would  
10 want to be treated and just look at your occupation from a  
11 perspective of humanity, it doesn't take somebody teaching you  
12 how to treat people in the community when you put on a  
13 uniform. It doesn't take all this.

14 All this time as I was canvassing Ferguson knocking  
15 on doors, people kept saying I wish they'd get rid of the  
16 Consent Decree because it's taking up money, and I'm like,  
17 okay, one thing about it is, like people were saying, this  
18 Consent Decree is not a check box list. It's a culture. It's  
19 a part of what you were taught when you were raised up as a  
20 child, treat people the way you want to be treated, and so  
21 when I see all these different things where they are putting  
22 people in places because of their color and not the content of  
23 their character, it doesn't make sense to me because when all  
24 of that falls down and then the administration, the  
25 presidential administration, come and they decide that they

1 don't want to have different procedures and policies because  
2 of your color, then what happens.

3           And I was at the town hall yesterday and I asked the  
4 question so when you all leave and all this law enforcement  
5 protection is not around Ferguson anymore, who stands up for  
6 us. You know, we have people in the community like the  
7 Civilian Review Board that will look at our complaints, but  
8 how long will it take for those complaints to be addressed and  
9 solved. You know, not to, you know, to have a babysitter or  
10 overseer to say this is how you treat your citizens, it  
11 doesn't make sense to me. And so I'm hoping and I'm  
12 praying -- I know it takes time. You know, it has taken over  
13 what is that, since 2017 for this to come to this point for  
14 people to say yes, we are doing a good job, which doesn't make  
15 sense. It's like a babysitter telling you you're doing a good  
16 job.

17           So as grown people, I think that the process, yes,  
18 like they were saying I mentioned yesterday about a website  
19 having -- you know, they have the website to show what the  
20 Consent Decree is, but to have a realtime space on their  
21 website so citizens can assess themselves and say this is what  
22 we are doing as a community along with the police and the City  
23 Council and the mayor and everybody else is doing in order to  
24 make the atmosphere in Ferguson the way it should be and not  
25 the way it's known for being. So I'm hoping that that point

1 of our being able to say yes, this is what we see is changing  
2 is in realtime.

3 And so like I said, I appreciate you allowing me to  
4 stand here before you as a citizen of Ferguson, and I'm  
5 hoping -- I know they were talking about different things that  
6 were being bought to secure Ferguson, like they have new  
7 fencing and everything in front of the police department. And  
8 so we are right around the corner with the tenth anniversary  
9 of Mike Brown commemoration and so I'm wondering why do we  
10 need to be secured that tight in order to, you know, make the  
11 police department a fortress. So I'm hoping things go well  
12 and the memory of justice is a calm situation and, like I say,  
13 we are able to as citizens voice our opinion after you all are  
14 gone and get justice in the same manner that we have now where  
15 we have somebody to be our voice for justice.

16 Thank you. My name is Erica M. Brooks. Thank you  
17 very much.

18 THE COURT: Thank you very much. All right. The  
19 last person who signed up was Ms. Cassandra Butler. Good  
20 morning.

21 MS. BUTLER: Good morning, Judge. Cassandra Butler.  
22 Thank you, Your Honor. I would like to give a semi status  
23 update on Ferguson as we come upon the Consent Decree's status  
24 hearing before the ten-year anniversary of the killing of  
25 Michael Brown. I understand that this event in and of itself

1 is not why we are here, but this event led to the DOJ  
2 discovering that indeed Ferguson had a practice and pattern of  
3 violating the civil rights of black people which is guaranteed  
4 by the United States Constitution. I want the duties of  
5 policing in Ferguson to stay in Ferguson. We are better now  
6 than then and we are getting better month by month, and I  
7 think the learning in the Ferguson Police Department can be  
8 the model for the whole county and state.

9           This pattern and practice that Ferguson was caught  
10 doing is not unique to Ferguson. It is fairly common in  
11 St. Louis County. Ferguson was the municipality that got  
12 caught with the dead black teenager in the streets at high  
13 noon on a Saturday, and although it could have been any  
14 municipality in the area, it happened in Ferguson. It is the  
15 responsibility of Ferguson to get this right for everyone. I  
16 want to thank the DOJ for intervening on behalf of the people  
17 who live in and drive through Ferguson.

18           However, the story of Ferguson is not even halfway  
19 through. The drama is still percolating, and it is driven in  
20 my opinion by the behavior of the council in whole. The  
21 micro-managing of the council plays a large role in the lack  
22 of leadership stability at the top levels of the police  
23 department and City Hall. With the latest election under the  
24 distorted banner of unity, many members of the council are  
25 intent on making Ferguson great again under the comfortable



1 rule of white superiority. This is not a ding on the  
2 employees or leadership itself at City Hall or at the police  
3 department. It is an observation of the aims and goals of the  
4 now majority on the council. The council has become even  
5 bolder since the last election. They show disdain about  
6 conflicts of interest concerns. They make ordinances that are  
7 special, special ordinance, to exempt and advantage one  
8 council member over other commercial landlords. They make  
9 ordinances about citizens must be current on their taxes  
10 before they can serve on a volunteer commission or board.  
11 Volunteer.

12 Ferguson is reverting back to the old Ferguson in  
13 some ways while making court designated strides in others. I  
14 often sit in council meetings amazed that many council members  
15 are oblivious to the fact that this behavior in their  
16 conversation, their discussion, is similar to the thinking  
17 that got us in the Consent Decree in the first place. I am  
18 grateful for the DOJ. We need this pressure in Ferguson, the  
19 pressure to be a better Ferguson. Thank you.

20 THE COURT: Thank you, Ms. Butler.

21 I appreciate all of the citizens who have spoken and  
22 I think you have all made very good points. And I guess I  
23 would like to hear from the City. It's time for the City to  
24 do its presentation. If you wish to address any of the things  
25 said by the citizens, of course, Mr. Selig you may do that or

1 tell us whatever you need to tell us.

2 MR. SELIG: Thank you, Your Honor. So I will turn it  
3 over to Chris Crabel for the substantive updates, but I wanted  
4 to make sure we had a few other people from the City come in  
5 that I wanted to introduce to make sure that they are  
6 recognized. We have Captain Harry Dilworth from the Ferguson  
7 Police Department here. We have Michelle Richmond, who is the  
8 Ferguson Municipal Court Administrator, and we have Shahidah  
9 Siraaaj who came in as well who is the executive assistant to  
10 the Ferguson Chief of Police.

11 So with that, I will turn it over to Chris Crabel for  
12 the substantive updates.

13 THE COURT: All right, Mr. Crabel, and again, if you  
14 don't mind coming to the lectern so we will all be able to  
15 hear you. Thank you very much.

16 MR. CRABEL: Good morning, Your Honor. My name is  
17 Chris Crabel. I am pleased to address you and the public  
18 today as the Consent Decree Coordinator for the City of  
19 Ferguson. I plan to provide an update on the progress of  
20 initiatives within the organization covering staffing, policy  
21 development, plan development, projects and audits, budgetary  
22 updates, and ongoing collaboration with our community groups.  
23 Additionally, I will address the significance of this being  
24 the ten-year anniversary of Michael Brown's death.

25 Starting with the staffing updates, over recent

1 months, our organization has made significant strides in  
2 recruiting and staffing, which is crucial to maintaining the  
3 operational effectiveness of the City. We have hired several  
4 new officers. As some of the citizens mentioned today, they  
5 have specialized skills, some in IT, some with drones, so we  
6 are really making strategic hires that will help the City move  
7 forward. However, we are still actively seeking qualified  
8 candidates for the deputy chief of police position, and we are  
9 also still hiring for police officers. Our efforts remain  
10 steadfast in building a diverse and capable team to serve our  
11 community efficiently.

12 Moving on to the policy update portion.

13 THE COURT: I have to ask you this again. Can you  
14 pull the microphone, just make it a little closer to you.  
15 There you go. Thanks.

16 MR. CRABEL: Okay. Is that better?

17 THE COURT: Yes.

18 MR. CRABEL: Perfect. We'll move on to policy  
19 updates. So the City of Ferguson in collaboration with the  
20 Department of Justice will hopefully be finalizing the First  
21 Amendment policy, today hopefully, so that will be a good step  
22 forward. This is a significant milestone in our ongoing  
23 efforts to align our practices with the principles of free  
24 speech and public assembly, so hopefully we can wrap that one  
25 up today.

1           Looking at plan development, since our last meeting,  
2 even before that, our focus is on developing comprehensive  
3 plans that continue to enhance our organizational  
4 effectiveness. So in the next few weeks, the City will be  
5 sharing a draft like I hate saying comprehensive plan, but a  
6 comprehensive document that will be showing, you know, our  
7 progress with the sections of the Consent Decree. It will be  
8 similar to our Smartsheets document that we have heard  
9 hundreds of times before, but it will be utilized a little bit  
10 differently, and with this, once this is, you know, finalized  
11 and reviewed by everyone, we can use this on the back end to  
12 create the comprehensive like dashboard that we have been  
13 working on for awhile. But while that is still being  
14 developed and while we are wrapping up the details, we can  
15 hope to be seeing some progress on that here soon in the  
16 future.

17           We have finalized the training plan with the  
18 understanding that additional trainings will be incorporated  
19 as they are developed, so the template's there and we're  
20 re-plugging in mass training that are developed with Lisa. We  
21 have made substantial progress and we are committed to setting  
22 and trying to meet all of our target dates that we have  
23 created with the Department of Justice.

24           The City has submitted its Crime Prevention Plan to  
25 the Monitoring Team and will be getting feedback shortly. And

1 once again, we are working with the National Police Institute  
2 on our staffing plan. We had started doing the staffing plan  
3 ourselves but realized that we needed a little bit more  
4 expertise, so we have reached out to a group that has that  
5 expertise, so we are utilizing them. Hopefully, we are still  
6 on track to meet our target date with that later this month,  
7 but we did have to reach out to an outside agency to help with  
8 that one.

9           Additionally, we have re-engaged with the  
10 Neighborhood Policing Steering Committee, or the NPSC, to  
11 assist with the Community Engagement and Community Policing  
12 Plan. I believe a few members of the community talked about  
13 that today. They were crucial in the initial plan, and as we  
14 have received feedback, we hope to utilize their expertise in  
15 creating the updated plan as well.

16           Moving on to projects and audits, we are actively  
17 working with the Monitoring Team on the use of force audit 2  
18 and the accountability and Civilian Review Board audit,  
19 providing some additional information as requested. The  
20 Monitor has provided some preliminary findings, and we are  
21 collaborating with them and supplying additional information  
22 needed. Additionally, we have submitted the draft of the  
23 Court's self-audit to the Department of Justice. Once we  
24 receive feedback on that, we will build up a more robust plan  
25 and send that off to the Monitor for review.

1           And despite some hiccups with our Microsoft 365  
2 conversion and all the delays it has caused with building the  
3 portal on the website, we are still working on the back end to  
4 create an interactive dashboard for the Consent Decree as I  
5 mentioned previously, but in the meantime while we are  
6 creating that, we are looking at addressing transparency  
7 concerns in a different way. So we are looking at maybe  
8 utilizing social media, creating short video clips to address,  
9 you know, frequently asked questions or concerns that citizens  
10 might have so we can have information out there in a different  
11 way in the interim while we get the website built up.

12           Moving on to budget updates, the City's budget has  
13 been passed by Council. This year more than ever we have  
14 allocated additional resources to the continued progress of  
15 the Consent Decree, particularly in areas of training. As you  
16 have seen, we have had a lot of moving parts with training,  
17 and they have also added funds to hire our own subject matter  
18 experts. This demonstrates our firm commitment to fulfilling  
19 our obligations and advancing our community's well-being with  
20 having that budget approved.

21           And then moving on to community groups, we are  
22 continuing to work with our community groups, and we are  
23 dedicated to reviving and refining our collaboration with  
24 them. Our goal is to strengthen these partnerships to better  
25 address the community needs and enhance the effectiveness of

1 our initiatives. A strong relationship with the community  
2 groups is essential for fostering trust, promoting  
3 transparency, and ensuring our efforts align with the values  
4 and priorities of our residents.

5 And we are coming up on the ten-year anniversary of  
6 Michael Brown's death. This year will mark the ten-year  
7 anniversary of his death, and it's a significant and somber  
8 milestone for our community. His death sparked a movement for  
9 justice and police reform that has had a profound impact on  
10 our city and beyond. As we reflect on this anniversary, we  
11 re-affirm our commitment to the principles of transparency,  
12 accountability, and community engagement that have guided our  
13 efforts under the Consent Decree. Our ongoing work is  
14 dedicated to ensure that the lessons learned from this tragedy  
15 continue to shape a more just and equitable future for all  
16 members of our community.

17 In conclusion, the progress and developments within  
18 the City of Ferguson underscore our unwavering commitment to  
19 excellence, community engagement, and continuous improvement.  
20 As we continue to navigate the challenges and opportunities  
21 ahead, we remain dedicated to building a safer more inclusive  
22 and more resilient Ferguson. Thank you.

23 THE COURT: Thank you, Mr. Crabel.

24 From the Department of Justice, Ms. Senier.

25 MS. SENIER: Good morning, Your Honor. Thank you for

1 the opportunity to address the Court and the public on the  
2 status of implementation of the Consent Decree. We want to  
3 thank all the members of the public who provided comments  
4 today. I hope that I address those during my remarks. We  
5 also want to thank the public for their continued engagement  
6 throughout the implementation process and in particular for  
7 organizing the community meeting last night as Ms. Mueller  
8 mentioned. We understand that one motivation behind holding  
9 that meeting was to provide some transparency on the status of  
10 implementation to date. So with the Court's permission, we  
11 would like to add some context to Mr. Crabel's updates in the  
12 interest of transparency.

13 Starting with, though the pace of implementation is  
14 not as we have long said where we would like it to be, there  
15 has indeed been progress, and we think it's important for  
16 people to know that. Firstly, FPD has implemented many if not  
17 most of the Decree required policies. Those we heard today  
18 are new revisions in policies may be needed for any newly  
19 acquired technology that may touch on areas governed by the  
20 Decree such as drones. Electronic force and accountability  
21 data systems are now up and running. This is helping with  
22 standardization of investigations, efficiency, and the ability  
23 to collect and analyze data related to force complaints.  
24 Several community engagement structures are now up and running  
25 including the Neighborhood Policing Steering Committee, the



1 Civilian Review Board. There has been a series of ten small  
2 group dialogues between officers and members of the community.  
3 There is now a community mediation program that mediates  
4 disputes not only between members of the community but also,  
5 you know, with the parties' agreement, officers and members of  
6 the community.

7 As Mr. Crabel said, FPD staffing is trending upward,  
8 I believe around 76 percent, and there is now key staff on  
9 board. In addition to having a very able Consent Decree  
10 coordinator, there is an enthusiastic and productive training  
11 coordinator, a public information officer who is working on  
12 community engagement as we heard today, and Chief Doyle  
13 continues to round out the ranks of his command staff.

14 The Monitor has deemed the Court amnesty program  
15 fully implemented, which is a significant milestone, and some  
16 training is complete and more is in the pipeline. As we heard  
17 today with input from the training committee, Ms. Stephens has  
18 completed a training plan and the Court may remember this was  
19 a key ask that we made the last time we were here. It's an  
20 important step because it lays the foundation and the roadmap  
21 for how FPD is going to design and deliver in-service  
22 training, and we think it's an important step because it  
23 really demonstrates that the department is taking ownership  
24 for its own training program.

25 Additionally, the department is right now delivering

1 training on fair and impartial policing with assistance from  
2 an outside trainer. As Mr. Crabel mentioned, we want to  
3 acknowledge the City's investment in engaging subject matter  
4 experts in training. This is a very positive development and  
5 one that we appreciate. Of course, we are still working with  
6 FPD to ensure that the content of the training is consistent  
7 with the requirements of the Decree, but there is no doubt  
8 that Ms. Stephens has accelerated the progress on training  
9 exponentially.

10 We also understand that some members of the community  
11 and city stakeholders may be frustrated by the perceived  
12 burden of implementation, so we did want to take this  
13 opportunity to clarify any misunderstanding that may be  
14 surrounding the Consent Decree; the first being the City is  
15 not paying the Department of Justice for the Consent Decree.  
16 On the contrary, the Department of Justice has provided  
17 substantial resources, both technical and financial, to the  
18 City and FPD since 2016. This has included a hiring grant in  
19 2016, actual training like Blue Courage in 2017 and camera  
20 training in 2022, connecting FPD to resources and training on  
21 deescalation and use of force in 2023, not to mention months  
22 of technical assistance on community engagement throughout  
23 2021.

24 Secondly, the Monitor in this case has been as we  
25 have said historically extremely sensitive to the financial

1 concerns of the City. She has been very judicious in the time  
2 that she and her subject matter experts spend on this matter,  
3 and the time that they do spend is heavily discounted or in  
4 some case entirely pro bono.

5 And lastly, perhaps most importantly, I think the  
6 results of our 2015 investigation revealed just how crucial it  
7 is that Ferguson have constitutional policing. It's part of  
8 the culture that Ms. Brooks spoke of. Everyone in Ferguson  
9 deserves constitutional policing and indeed many of the  
10 reforms set out in the Consent Decree including training,  
11 accountability structures, data systems are simply part and  
12 parcel of having an effective law enforcement agency in the  
13 21st Century. So we want the public and the Court to be  
14 assured that DOJ is doing everything it can to not only help  
15 the City and FPD implement the Decree but also hold them  
16 accountable when they are not, so this is why we continue to  
17 meet with FPD on a regular basis asking for things like  
18 policies and trainings. It's why we provide the kind of  
19 assistance that I outlined earlier, and it's why when we face  
20 roadblocks, we approach the Court for assistance in working  
21 through those, and both the Court and the City have been very  
22 responsive to that.

23 So to that end, we just want to map out where we  
24 think the path forward remains, and it always starts with  
25 expanding engagement on the Decree throughout FPD and the

1 City. We expect greater engagement with the Decree within the  
2 department. As we have long said for too long, the burden of  
3 implementation has fallen on one or two people who have too  
4 much else on their plate, so it's our hope that with the new  
5 hires, particularly at the command level, that they will  
6 embrace various tasks that are required under the Decree.

7 Training, as I have already said, you know, the City  
8 and FPD are working on this with Ms. Stephens, and again the  
9 City as Mr. Crabel said have demonstrated their commitment to  
10 investing in this area and we appreciate that.

11 As people have said today, we are looking for more  
12 transparency on progress. We understand very well that there  
13 are many challenges in trying to stand up a new website, and  
14 we are sympathetic to that. We understand that the City is  
15 trying its utmost, but given the hunger for information on  
16 progress under the Decree, we are hoping that the City will at  
17 least consider some alternatives in the interim. You know,  
18 people are craving some sort of a chart or a status update  
19 mechanism. Even if it's rudimentary, they just want  
20 information.

21 Lastly, we think assessments are critical to the path  
22 forward. We appreciate the Monitoring Team is now conducting  
23 use of force and accountability audits, and they have already  
24 teed up the cameras, and courts are coming next. As we  
25 mentioned during our last appearance, we are working with the

1 City to help them design a self-assessment for the municipal  
2 court. We think this is going to be important to again  
3 increase transparency, perhaps accelerate the final steps of  
4 implementation within the court and to give the City a roadmap  
5 for how it might assess its own performance on the policing  
6 side of the Consent Decree.

7 Last night, Your Honor, we got questions like we  
8 heard today about what happens when the Consent Decree ends.  
9 When does it end, what happens after it ends. Well, it ends  
10 by the terms of the Decree, when there is full and effective  
11 compliance and that's sustained for a period of two years.  
12 But to get there, it's created remedies that are designed to  
13 be durable, and what that means is that FPD will end up an  
14 agency that is reflective, that is able to course correct  
15 without the oversight of DOJ, the Monitor, or the Court.

16 So with that, I don't have anything else to add  
17 unless you have questions.

18 THE COURT: Thank you. That was helpful. Ms. Caruso  
19 on behalf of the Monitor.

20 MS. CARUSO: Thank you and good morning. I would  
21 like to start by expressing my appreciation on behalf of the  
22 Monitoring Team for all of the members of the community who  
23 took time to attend today's hearing and who addressed the  
24 Court this morning. Thank you. I thank all of you. The  
25 community continues to stay engaged as is evidenced by the

1 event that was sponsored last night by PROUD and the NPSC in  
2 which the DOJ presented at and in which I was very happy to  
3 attend via Zoom. Community engagement and active  
4 participation continues to be an integral aspect of  
5 implementation of the Consent Decree.

6           The City and DOJ have in each of their remarks  
7 provided a clear picture of where we stand today. I have a  
8 bit more comment and context from the perspective of the  
9 Monitoring Team, but I will try not to repeat too much of  
10 what's been said. I do want to say, which is worth repeating,  
11 that we have been tremendously pleased and impressed by the  
12 two new hires, Patricia Washington, the City's new public  
13 information officer, and Lisa Stephens, the training  
14 coordinator. As the Court knows, the need to fill these  
15 critical positions endured for many years.

16           There has been immense progress in the area of  
17 training since the arrival of Lisa Stephens in February of  
18 2024. She has moved with both diligence and haste to put  
19 together trainings and to further develop the long outstanding  
20 training plan which we have often discussed. We have seen  
21 this area move at a faster pace since her arrival, and as has  
22 been noted before in our last quarterly status hearing, the  
23 FPD has been able to meet target dates for submission of draft  
24 training plans in March and then more recently in April as  
25 well. Training remains a critical area of the Consent Decree

1 that has often been the log jam between policy development and  
2 the Monitoring Team's ability to assess implementation of  
3 those policies. For example, in the area of stop searches and  
4 arrests, a couple policies such as the strip and cavity search  
5 and correctable violations policies have been fully developed  
6 but have not yet been trained on. There are a few examples of  
7 policies like that that just need to move through training  
8 next.

9           The duration of time that can pass between completion  
10 of the policy and roll out of role call training or in-service  
11 training has met delays in those policies being implemented.  
12 We have already seen this trend start to buckle under  
13 Ms. Stephens's leadership during her short time here. Even  
14 this morning FPD, as has already been mentioned, is hosting an  
15 implicit bias and policing training that will move that area  
16 of the Consent Decree into a place where it is getting close  
17 to ready for assessment.

18           It is no doubt a tall ask to manage both the steady  
19 roll-out of all of the role call trainings, the in-service  
20 trainings while also managing the larger more comprehensive  
21 and logistically challenging training plan, but Ms. Stephens  
22 has proven incredibly capable in doing so already.

23           Similarly, Patricia Washington as public information  
24 officer is a critical member of FPD dedicated to building and  
25 solidifying community engagement and policing plans, another

1 area as Ms. Senier has already stated of the Consent Decree  
2 where we hope to see more timely and concentrated progress  
3 made over the next year. We are anxious to see how the City  
4 can enhance its communication with the community under her  
5 leadership.

6 As Mr. Crabel mentioned, the City's trend line is  
7 positive with respect to staffing and has been able to recruit  
8 into FPD with good momentum. From our discussion with the  
9 parties yesterday while we had an on-site visit, it is clear  
10 the City recognizes it must do more to track and report out on  
11 its progress and that it is committed to increasing  
12 transparency. A dashboard doing exactly this is under way,  
13 and while it is being finalized, we encouraged the City to  
14 implement more immediate solutions to both the issue of  
15 internally tracking top priorities related to the Consent  
16 Decree and publicly sharing information about its progress in  
17 activities with the community. It's great to hear Mr. Crabel  
18 already say this morning that the City is planning to do this,  
19 planning to share a progress plan for implementation in the  
20 next few weeks with DOJ and the Monitoring Team and to do  
21 updating to the community through social media and FAQs.

22 I will not repeat the status of each policy and  
23 training already presented, but I do want to note, especially  
24 because this came up in the public comment, that the  
25 Monitoring Team is finalizing its comments to the Crime



1 Prevention Plan, and we thank the City of completing this  
2 plan. Our subject matter expert, Dr. Leigh Anderson, is  
3 leading the review and the Monitor's comments to this plan.  
4 The Crime Prevention Plan is one of four plans that has been  
5 the long focus of many hearings; the others being the Training  
6 Plan, the Community Policing and Engagement Plan, and the  
7 Staffing Study and Recruitment Plan. FPD's new staffing,  
8 which I have just discussed, as well as its partnership which  
9 Mr. Crabel referenced with NPI -- that's the National Police  
10 Institute -- who is assisting with the staffing study suggests  
11 they should be well positioned to wrap these plans up, and we  
12 hope they will be able to report as much at the next quarterly  
13 hearing.

14           The Monitoring Team has otherwise moved forward with  
15 the areas that are ripe for assessment. We conducted a second  
16 use of force audit and have provided a preliminary summary of  
17 our results from that audit. This audit looks at use of force  
18 incidents and investigations from the calendar years 2022 and  
19 2023. The Monitoring Team used a use of force audit checklist  
20 to guide its review. In each case it was graded as  
21 satisfactory or unsatisfactory. Some of the factors we have  
22 reviewed to give the community an understanding of what we  
23 were looking at include documentation, whether reports are  
24 timely, accurate, complete; deescalation, whether officers  
25 provide verbal warnings prior to using force or otherwise take

1 meaningful steps to stabilize or deescalate the situation;  
2 force response including whether force was objectively  
3 reasonable and proportional to the level of resistance,  
4 whether it was used in a retaliatory manner or whether the  
5 officer provided immediate necessary medical assistance where  
6 applicable; force reporting including was each use of force  
7 identified, reported and justified; enforce investigation  
8 including whether the supervisor conducted required interviews  
9 and responded to deficiencies appropriately.

10           The parties met yesterday to discuss preliminary  
11 results, and additional analysis will be conducted by the  
12 Monitoring Team before finalizing and publishing the results  
13 of our assessment. We thank the City for cooperating with us  
14 and providing additional information that we have requested.  
15 The initial results represent an improvement in percentage of  
16 cases rated as satisfactory from the Monitoring Team's initial  
17 audit of 2019 to 2021 reports. Areas for improvement include  
18 incidences where the type of force was mis-categorized and  
19 where officers directed discourteous or profane language at  
20 detainees or engaged in unprofessional communications.  
21 Yesterday, the parties engaged in productive discussions about  
22 how FPD can improve the quality of its own force  
23 investigations as well as how FPD's computer programs,  
24 particularly Benchmark, can better support its work. We look  
25 forward to concluding this audit and releasing our results in

1 the near term as well as continuing with phase 2 of the use of  
2 force audit which will review incidences in which we might  
3 have expected to see a use of force report such as resisting  
4 arrests but where no force was actually reported.

5 The ongoing use of force audit has been led by  
6 Monitoring Team member Darryl Owens who is here with us today  
7 and who joined the meeting yesterday to discuss the  
8 preliminary results with the parties and who has been doing  
9 excellent work on behalf of our team in this area.

10 The Monitoring Team is also planning to launch our  
11 first body worn camera audit. We would like to welcome two  
12 new members of the Monitoring Team who will lead this audit,  
13 Daniel Gomez and Roger Nunez. Dan Gomez who I also introduced  
14 here with us today joined us yesterday for a site visit and  
15 in-person meetings at FPD. He is a co-founder and chief  
16 technology officer at TacLogix who provides consulting to  
17 public safety agencies as well as comprehensive technology  
18 assessments and policy and training development services.  
19 Mr. Gomez is a 27-year veteran of the Los Angeles Police  
20 Department where he rose through the ranks to serve as the  
21 department's chief technology officer and led its tactical  
22 technology section and established the LAPD's first innovation  
23 and strategic planning division. Among many other things, he  
24 has been responsible for the deployment of over 7,000 body  
25 worn cameras and smart phone deployment after conducting

1 extensive research and field testing and works on the Newark  
2 Consent Decree and as a consultant with the Department of  
3 Justice on the Puerto Rico Consent Decree. So we are in very  
4 good hands with Mr. Gomez leading our body worn camera audit  
5 and we thank him for being with us today. He will be working  
6 on that with his colleague, Mr. Nunez, who is not here today  
7 but who also has significant experience with the LAPD and who  
8 specialized in deploying, integrating, and teaching technology  
9 applications and equipment to LAPD's 13,000 sworn and civilian  
10 members.

11 In addition to beginning the body worn camera audit  
12 in the near term, the Monitoring Team plans to bring on one  
13 additional subject matter expert to assist with the ongoing  
14 accountability audit. Yesterday, the Monitor was also able to  
15 move that assessment forward by reviewing the Civilian Review  
16 Board binders and documentation during an on-site visit at  
17 City Hall.

18 With respect to the municipal court, our 2023 status  
19 report indicated completion and compliance with the  
20 comprehensive amnesty program. The City under  
21 Ms. Washington's leadership is preparing for a public  
22 education campaign regarding municipal court processes to be  
23 held this summer, and additionally with respect to future  
24 audits as has been mentioned, the City is developing a  
25 self-assessment methodology with input from the Monitoring

1 Team and support from DOJ. So rather than the Monitoring Team  
2 conducting additional independent audits, this process will  
3 have the Ferguson Municipal Court self audit, which will allow  
4 it to comply with paragraph 360 which requires it to conduct  
5 regular assessments of its own court practices to ensure that  
6 municipal court proceedings are administered fairly and in  
7 accordance with policy and federal and state law. The  
8 Monitoring Team will then assess the validity and compliance  
9 with that paragraph by reviewing the City's self-assessments  
10 in that area.

11 Over the next quarter, we will continue with ongoing  
12 audits and commence the body worn camera assessment. Where  
13 possible, we will include any results with our next status  
14 report and report out publicly as we finalize those results.  
15 We will plan to publish our next status report in advance of  
16 the end of the summer.

17 I also want to close by saying as we approach the  
18 ten-year anniversary of Michael Brown's breath, we are  
19 heartened to hear that the City has been reflecting on the  
20 significance of this anniversary and has affirmatively stated  
21 here today its continued commitment to the Consent Decree and  
22 to shaping a more just and equitable Ferguson. So we thank  
23 you for that. And I'd be happy to take any questions if the  
24 Court has any.

25 THE COURT: I do not have any. I do want to welcome

1 the new member of the team, and I am very grateful to the  
2 subject matter experts that you have used, and I think --  
3 well, I appreciate the progress that's being made.

4 Mr. Selig, do you wish to make any responses to  
5 anything anybody else has said?

6 MR. SELIG: Just very briefly, Your Honor. The City  
7 would like to thank the DOJ and the Monitor for coming early  
8 yesterday to the City and to the police department so that the  
9 parties could meet in-person to go over some of the policies  
10 that have been outstanding and get some of those policies  
11 across the finish line. We thought it was particularly  
12 helpful with respect to the use of force audit that Ms. Caruso  
13 just discussed. But that's all that I have, Your Honor.

14 THE COURT: You know, the members of the public  
15 probably know this, but often at these meetings, we do have  
16 even though everyone stands up and is very polite, it's not  
17 like some of my lawsuits where everybody is screaming at each  
18 other and yelling all the time, but we also have frequently  
19 been met after the hearings and had very frank and not always  
20 as easy discussions as we are having here in public, and I  
21 think it has shown progress, and I think the citizens of  
22 Ferguson should be pleased with the progress you have seen. I  
23 hope that -- you know, I'm with Ms. Brooks in thinking that it  
24 would be wonderful if everyone in the world would just behave  
25 the way their mothers taught them or should have taught them

1 and done what's right and my job would be a lot easier, but I  
2 think that we are getting closer to doing that, and I think a  
3 lot of this is -- well, obviously the court system is  
4 different, and that has been very significant to see that.  
5 The police department also I think, as many people have  
6 commented but appears to me, is also changing its culture in a  
7 positive way.

8           And I guess I would echo what others have said here  
9 today, that the changes that are happening in Ferguson, in the  
10 court system and in the police system and in the engagement  
11 with the community, these are things that are necessary for  
12 fully providing the constitutional rights that the  
13 Constitution guarantees to all citizens and making sure that  
14 they are. This is the kind of policing that everyone should  
15 have, and we are working towards that, and I think whoever  
16 mentioned that it could be a model for the county and more I  
17 think is correct.

18           You know, I remember well the very beginning hearing  
19 I had with many of the same people who are here when the issue  
20 of approving the Consent Decree was in front of me, and at  
21 that hearing, there was a lot of sentiment expressed by  
22 members of the public that, you know, Ferguson is not any  
23 worse than a bunch of the other municipalities or everybody is  
24 doing it, it has the same failings, and, you know, to some  
25 extent I think that is true, that everybody has similar

1 failings, but that's changing and things have changed since  
2 the time of the approval of this Consent Decree and entering  
3 into it, certainly since Michael Brown's death. I know that  
4 there continue to be terrible incidents that happen throughout  
5 our country, but I can see real change, and I think Ferguson  
6 is leading the way by complying with this Consent Decree, and  
7 I really appreciate what you all are doing, and I think that  
8 it could be a model for others to see that yes, it is very  
9 possible to run a city and comply with and run a court system  
10 and run a police department and respect everyone's  
11 constitutional rights and have what we are all hoping everyone  
12 can adopt, but I certainly think Ferguson is showing us.

13           We're not perfect. We have got a ways to go. As  
14 everyone knows, when we meet and talk, it's how much longer  
15 will this go on and when can we get there, but we are getting  
16 there and the progress especially this year has been very  
17 good, so I'm hopeful that, you know, we'll get to a point  
18 where you won't need us to be doing this, but we are not there  
19 yet, but I do think everyone should be pleased with the  
20 progress that's been made.

21           So with that said, I'm going to close the hearing,  
22 but I do again want to thank all the parties who are here, the  
23 Monitor, the Department of Justice, the City employees and  
24 officials, but also the citizens who are doing what you are  
25 doing in just coming here today and being part of this process



1 or listening on YouTube if you are listening. I think it's a  
2 very good step and I appreciate that everyone still wants to  
3 be involved in this progress because it is a team effort and  
4 we need everybody here to be continuing to work on it. So  
5 thank you all very much, and with that said, Court's in  
6 recess.

7 **(PROCEEDINGS CONCLUDED AT 11:05 A.M.)**  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATE

1  
2  
3 I, Angela K. Daley, Registered Merit Reporter and  
4 Certified Realtime Reporter, hereby certify that I am a duly  
5 appointed Official Court Reporter of the United States  
6 District Court for the Eastern District of Missouri.

7 I further certify that the foregoing is a true and  
8 accurate transcript of the proceedings held in the  
9 above-entitled case and that said transcript is a true and  
10 correct transcription of my stenographic notes.

11 I further certify that this transcript contains  
12 pages 1 through 41 inclusive and that this reporter takes no  
13 responsibility for missing or damaged pages of this transcript  
14 when same transcript is copied by any party other than this  
15 reporter.

16 Dated at St. Louis, Missouri, this 15th day of July,  
17 2024.

18  
19  
20 /s/Angela K. Daley  
21 Angela K. Daley, CSR, RMR, FCRR, CRR  
22 Official Court Reporter  
23  
24  
25